IRSTI 14.01.21 UDK 82.09 DOI 10.47649/vau.2021.v62.i3.06

# Zh.Yersaiynova<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Kh.Dosmukhamedov Atyrau university Atyrau, 060011, Kazakhstan e-mail: <u>zh.ersayynova@asu.edu.kz</u>

# CRITICAL LITERATURE REVIEW ABOUT THE EFFECTS OF GLOBALISATION ON KAZAKHSTANI EDUCATION SYSTEM

**Abstract.** The process of globalization is a continuous phenomenon that permeates all spheres of life. One of the widespread areas is education. Given article is a critical review of the literature on the effects of globalisation and how it affected the education system of Kazakhstan. The topic is of considerable interest due to the increasing borrowing of 'best practices' from powerful economies.

The development of 'human capital' is one of the priorities for Kazakhstan that had been reflected in multitude of state documents. With the rise of NIS network of schools, which is taken as an example in the article, new concepts of education were introduced in the time. Critical thinking, ICT competence, language fluency, communication and collaboration skills are a range of requirements being trained in the schools of a new format. A range of authors look sceptically at this trend when some patterns in the education system bear doubtful resemblances.

The article also discusses examples of best practices, critical views of researchers on this topic, analyzes the positive or negative effects of changes brought into education system of Kazakhstan.

**Key words:** globalisation, Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools, best practices.

**Introduction.** Education has been affected diversely since globalisation started to permeate in the educational and cultural arena of Kazakhstan. Globalisation of education is characterised by national educational systems being strongly influenced by practices received from other countries [14]. Kazakhstan is not an exemption. As part of the global community on one hand and having a status of a developing country on the other, Kazakhstan had been in urge for the rise of its educational system because the impact left historically had to be modernised and values and beliefs of Kazakhstani people kept. The development of the 'human capital' of the nation through education is one of the priorities and challenges for Kazakhstan [2].

During these years since independence receive, there were many collaborations with other countries to gain best practices and many of them, apparently, facilitated the building of intellectual capacity of the nation. As any other nation-state, Kazakhstan puts preserving its national identity and a centuries-long traditions and history first. Thus, there was a question raised whether integration with other countries carries a subversive effect on its indigenous culture and education.

In this article, purpose is put forward to explore and draw evidence on how globalisation affected Kazakhstan on educational and cultural perspectives and attempt to deliver that these impacts have been positive rather than negative.

Material and methods of research. Education in Kazakhstan is still experiencing changes and is in the process of forming its own solid grounds. Nineteenth-century Russian colonization had strong influence on national culture and national education system until certain time [5, c.75]. When Kazakhstan dismembered itself from the Soviet power, the country inevitably encountered challenges in its political, social and economic dimensions [5, c.75]. In addition, transition of Kazakhstan to market economy was challenging as there were absence of certain institutions that regulate it [2].

In order to comply with international educational standards, Kazakhstan has been seeking for best practices in order to translate it to all state schools [18, c.446]. And so-called 'best practices' were brought into education system of Kazakhstan. Novelties were brought in partnering with the world-famous University of Cambridge, University of Pennsylvania and other contingent of global institutions that contributed to the development of state programs [2]. The prime outcome of such partnership came in the creation of academic curriculum that responded both requirements and challenges of a globalising world and intertwined in it was cultural and national features of the country. As a result of such cooperation, students were introduced to a 12-year schooling system which allowed graduates to gain knowledge at the universities abroad without a Year One requirement which eased their pace towards global education. Along with instruction in their native language, Kazakh, and historically acquired Russian, students have started to be taught in English. These received experiences into national education entailed a series of positive changes for further development.

However, things to be considered from two angles. Authors are split into two, arguing that countries are losing distinctive features of their education and shifting to what has been named as international model of education or 'best practices' [15, c.3]. Particularly, global education corporations are said to have been impacting school policies worldwide [14]. It is becoming salient that business purposes are moving forward in such cases. Educational deals bring great profits for companies to deliver their services. Khamsi notes that with globalization coming through education system, one thing is apparent: national education system has become fragmented and to contain many actors, and completely different vision revolve around on how knowledge produced and disseminated.

On the contrary, other authors celebrate such movement of reforms as they believe these 'best practices' have been applied to the utmost of countries' necessities. Suárez-Orozco and Qin-Hilliard [17] note our world had become intricate as a result of globalization. This, in turn, implies that in order to meet challenges posed by globalization, countries are to reconsider what they teach and what skills they train because contemporary world has shifted its view and now the world requires people who are highly adaptable and have skills to solve problems.

The state leader Nazarbayev in his Address to the People of Kazakhstan accentuated the role of education in a globalising world [8]. He continued to pinpoint the importance of developing 'human capital' in the Kazakhstan 2050 strategy. After some time, to enhance the development of 'human capital', state leader issued the program 'Intellectual Nation 2020' to ensure Kazakhstan's competitive potential in the global arena. The project aimed at educating a new generation of Kazakhstan and prepare them to be responsive to new challenges. As a result of previously mentioned projects, a network of flagship schools, namely Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools came out [2, c.75]:

"...Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools project shall become one of the key projects facilitating modernization of the secondary education system. These schools are to become the experimental sites for the development, introduction and testing of educational programmes for kindergarten and preschool, as well as educational programmes for 12-year secondary education. These programmes shall combine the best traditions of Kazakhstan education and international best pedagogic practice, providing profiled preparation of students by Physics and Mathematics, Chemistry and Biology directions, and encouraging advanced study of languages, i.e. 'the main site for testing the polylingual educational model and educational innovations' [10].

These network of schools, being autonomous in its nature, had no analogues at the time of creation. The schools became the base for educational experiments and had several tasks set. First, the Intellectual Schools were challenged to obtain best practices to test and second, network of schools had to disseminate its practice with other schools in the country [2].

**Results and their discussion.** There have been a range of novelties that NIS introduced into secondary educational system. Teaching students to be proficient in three languages and using them as

languages of instruction at the same time, NIS students are taught newly received courses called 'Global perspectives' and Creative Arts along with subjects as Kazakh history, World History, Geography, Science, Mathematics and ICT. It is noteworthy that accent is made on developing 'skills' in the curriculum. The curriculum development has fundamentally changed engrained views. Thereby, new curriculum makes accent on not what students automatically remembered and reproduced but whether they are able to 'apply knowledge in unfamiliar conditions; to interpret information; to explain why and how; to investigate; to communicate; to work creatively' [2].

Another thing that needs attention about school organization was that school had its particular set of missions, vision and slogan that can be traced in most educational institutions around the world. Schools have defined for themselves that students of a new era ought to have an in-depth knowledge and understanding of subjects; have self-learning skills; schools instil in students critical thinking, being fluent in multiple languages, use IT confidently, work in collaboration with others and perhaps most important of all, be a citizen of the world [13]. At a glance, such list of requirements for students look very impressive and require great returns on the part of children, however education reforms are constructed to cover important aspects of contemporary education so as to prepare generation to tackle challenges of globalization.

Steiner-Khamsi and Waldow [15] claim that education reforms borrowed from elsewhere are astonishingly similar in their nature. Authors claim policy borrowing is carried out due to political and economic ambitions. Countries gaining such practices are varied in their social, political and economic levels, and it has happened that policy makers have begun to label them as 'best practices', or 'international standards'. Zambeta [4] agrees to the viewpoint that policies enacted by large international organizations pursue economic perspectives and aimed at aligning education standards internationally and knowledge is accepted only as a tool to reach those ambitions.

#### **Critical thinking**

The borrowing of certain elements in the case of Kazakhstan can be considered to have beneficial effects overall. One of such elements is introduction of critical thinking into education system that had lifted many questions. The intervention of critical thinking in educational institutions have challenged both students and teachers to work and solve issues creatively. However, some moments of its application were difficult due to cultural aspects of the country [3, c.6]. The notion of critical thinking approach, which is widely known and required in Western universities, has fundamentally converted the way subjects used to be taught. Critical thinking is thought to enhance students' participation in classes and students become generators of new ideas replacing former role of teachers. One of the legacies left by being part of the Soviet Union was the central role of memorization and in classes, materials received was not often discussed [3, c.8]. On top of that, authors continue such way of educating people impinged their abilities to refute and express their own views [3, c.8]. Therefore, the creation of an active learning environment has had a beneficial impact on how students perceive and reproduce information, and in turn, teachers had become recipients of a new different role, the role of a facilitator, in order to let students, decide for themselves.

In the contemporary and interconnected world, Kazakhstan is engaging with organizations to assess and identify its education quality. It is asserted that being exercised by international assessment systems, countries obtain valid information and set goals that help them better their education. Results of Kazakhstani students earned in PISA 2018 were lower than average. 'PISA seeks to assess not merely whether students can reproduce what they have learned, but also to examine how well they can extrapolate from what they have learned and apply their knowledge in novel settings, ones related to school and non-school contexts' [11]. According to Malakhasyan [7], Kazakhstani students showed good results in comparison with others in reproductive tasks which shows the mastery of knowledge. Notwithstanding, their results were lower when they had to apply their knowledge to solve practical

tasks, related to real-life situations, the content of which was presented in an unusual, non-standard form; it was rather necessary to analyse data or interpret it, make conclusions or attempt to give predictions for repercussions of events. Range of authors agree that 'creative thinking, innovation and problem-solving are valued over and above the consolidation of static knowledge stocks' [12, c.5-6]. This situation became main stimulus for government to direct network of NIS schools to disseminate its received practice with other mainstream schools. The new curriculum implemented in the network of schools aimed to provide the basic aspects of active learning and the ways of its implementation in the lessons have been considered [2]. It takes as its basic the necessity to train students to model and analyse close to real-life situations [7].

At the end of the spectrum is the problem of dissemination of that practice along with good provision of necessary tools for education. With curriculum adapted for the schools of a new time, NIS schools have had freedom in its work as it is an autonomous organization and is governed by state owned joint-stock company Orken, which enhances the effective work of schools [2, c.73]. Thus, with introduction of a new programme there are issues related to what extent mainstream schools are provided with necessary facilities and resources to deliver desired learning outcomes.

Since NIS schools are financially well supported, such type of schools provide modern technologies for teaching, rooms for science subjects, rooms aimed at creative development, lounges, large libraries and conference rooms. Lack of facilities at mainstream schools hinder the process of total integration of schools and how they address the challenges of contemporary requirements of education. Likewise, rural schools find it difficult to cover all the aspects for better learning and fulfil the goals set by ambitious government. Therefore, government is to consider the provision of equal opportunities for state schools in order to consistently head towards the intended goal. Teachers need to acquire the effective use of expanding contemporary technologies, be it ICT or any other technologies that facilitate student learning [17, c.4].

### English as a connecting power

Another point education system attempts to make these days is connected to English. As a result of globalisation, it has widespread all over the country becoming a language to learn for plenty of purposes. Spring [14] denotes to English as one of key components of educational globalization. Massive learning of English in Kazakhstan firstly was stipulated by the fact that English has permeated all spheres of our society. Another reason of English taking a serious standing was underpinned by trilingual policy gradually enacted in our country that required citizens to be proficient in all these three languages. Students have started to be taught English as second foreign language along with their mother tongue Kazakh language and officially enacted Russian language which is considered to be the language of international relations. This has been reflected in the annual message of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, N.Nazarbayev [8] for Kazakhstani people where he presented the strategy Kazakhstan 2050 and highlighted the importance of trilingual policy:

'Being able to communicate in the language of the modern world will reveal new and unlimited opportunities for each citizen of our country'.

Even more challenging was The State Program on Language Development and Functioning in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2019 [6], where it had been stated that by 2019, 27% of population would have acquired English as third foreign language within this programme. All conditions are being created to fulfil this goal. The main concern for future will become whether these attempts fit into time frames and held effectively throughout the country.

#### Conclusion.

In the context of Kazakhstan much is still to be done for its education to flourish and find its own way in the global education. As in any other country, it is impossible not to note the positive role of globalization and practice of borrowing policies from other countries. Nowadays, education is considered the main tool to build a benevolent future. Therefore, developing and sustaining the human capital, as has been mentioned earlier plays a major role for the country as a whole. It has now become important to work at the same pace to disseminate the best practices of flagship schools and to train the teaching staff of secondary schools in cities and regions. It is important to provide schools with equipment for holistic teaching experience and the creation of equal opportunities for all students in the country. Of high importance as well is maintaining active learning environment in order to teach students not only to accumulate subject knowledge but also successfully apply that knowledge in practice and be able to apply different skills into tasks that life, indeed demand of students.

#### References

- 1 Ball S. J. The Education debate, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. The policy press, 2013. p.31.
- 2 Bridges D. Educational reform and internationalisation. The case of School reform in Kazakhstan (ed). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- 3 Burkhalter N. and Shegebayev R.M. Critical thinking as culture: Teaching post-Soviet teachers in Kazakhstan, International Review of Education, 58(1), 17 March 2012, pp.6-8.
- 4 Coulby D. and Zambeta E. 'Globalization and nationalism in education' (ed). Oxon: Routledge (World Yearbook of education 2005), p.2.
- 5 DeYoung A.J. and Nadirbekyzy B. 'Redefining schooling and community in post-Soviet Kazakhstan', Journal of Education Policy, 1997, 12(1-2), pp. 71-78. doi:10.1080/0268093970120111
- 6 Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Prime Minister of the Republic of Kazakhstan), State Program on Language Development and Functioning in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2019, 2 July 2018 Available at: https://egov.kz/cms/ru/law/list/P1800000401
- 7 Malakhasyan E.G. 'Osnovnye aspekty obnovlennogo soderzhaniya srednego obrazovaniya Respubliki Kazahstan' 'Main aspects of updated secondary education content of Republic of Kazakhstan', Otkrutaya shkola, 2016, 6(157) <a href="http://www.open-school.kz/glavstr/tema\_nomera/tema\_nomera\_157\_1.htm">http://www.open-school.kz/glavstr/tema\_nomera/tema\_nomera\_157\_1.htm</a>
- 8 Nazarbayev N. 'Kazakhstan 2050 Strategy: New Political Course of the Established State'. Annual State of the Nation Address. Astana, December 2012. <a href="http://www.akorda.kz/en/addresses/addresses\_of\_president/address-by-the-president-of-the-republic-of-kazakhstan-leader-of-the-nation-nnazarbayev-strategy-kazakhstan-2050-new-political-course-of-the-established-state">http://www.akorda.kz/en/addresses/addresses\_of\_president/address-by-the-president-of-the-republic-of-kazakhstan-leader-of-the-nation-nnazarbayev-strategy-kazakhstan-2050-new-political-course-of-the-established-state</a>
- 9 Nazarbayev N. 'Speech of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan at the Forum of the Bolashak Programme's Scholars'. 30 January, 2008.
- 10 Nazarbayev N. The Strategic Plan for Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan until the year 2020 Decree of the President of the RK No.922, 2010. http://www.akorda.kz/en/official\_documents/strategies\_and\_programs
- 11 OECD PISA 2006 science competencies for tomorrow's world, executive summary. Paris: OECD, 2007, p.16. Accessed in February 18, 2020 <a href="https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/education/pisa-2006\_9789264040014-en">https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/education/pisa-2006\_9789264040014-en</a>
- 12 Ozga J., Seddon T., and Popkewitz S.T. 'Education research and Policy'(ed). Oxon: Routledge (World Yearbook of Education 2006), pp.5-6.
  - 13 Slogans and missions of network of NIS schools, atr.nis.edu.kz
  - 14 Spring J. Globalization of Education. An Introduction. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. New York: Routledge, 2015
- 15 Steiner-Khamsi G., Waldow F., Seddon T., Ozga J., Zanten v.A., (2012) 'Policy Borrowing and Lending in Education'. Oxon: Routledge (World Yearbook of Education 2012) p.3.
- 16 Suárez-Orozco M.M. and Qin-Hilliard D.B. Globalization: Culture and education in the new millennium. California: University of California Press, 2004.
- 17 Townsend T. and Bates R. 'Handbook of Teacher education: Globalization, standards and professionalism in times of change'(ed). The Netherlands: Springer, 2007. p.4.
- 18 Yakavets N. 'Negotiating the principles and practice of school leadership: the Kazakhstan experience', Educational Management Administration and Leadership, 2016, 45(3), pp. 445-465. doi:10.1177/1741143216628537.

# ЖАҺАНДАНУ ҮДЕРІСІНІҢ ҚАЗАҚСТАННЫҢ БІЛІМ БЕРУ ЖҮЙЕСІНЕ ТИГІЗГЕН ӘСЕРІ ТУРАЛЫ ӘДЕБИ ШОЛУ

**Андатпа.** Жаһандану үдерісі қазіргі уақытта барлық салаларға енген тоқтаусыз құбылыс. Соның бір айқын таралған саласы білім саласы екені сөзсіз. Мақала Қазақстанның білім беру жүйесіне жаһандану үдерісінің әкелген әсерін, өткені мен бүгінгісіне назар аудара отырып, талқылайды.

Адами капиталды қалыптастыру Қазақстан үшін өзекті мәселелердің қатарынан екендігі ел үшін маңызды бірқатар құжаттамаларда аталған болатын. Адами капиталды жетілдіруде білім жүйесінде жасалған қадамдар талқыланып, осы турасында Назарбаев зияткерлік мектептері мысал ретінде алынады. Өз уақытында осы мектептер желісі негізінде орта білім жүйесіне жаңа концептілер таныстырылған болатын. Білім беру саласы заман талабына сай сын тұрғысынан ойлау, АКТ сауаттылығы, тілдерді жетік меңгеру, коммуникациялық және коллаборативті (бірлесе жұмыс жасау) жұмыс жасау және тағы да басқа дағдылардың жетілуіне баса назар аударады. Шетелдік авторлар мұндай жаңа концептілердің көптеген елдердің өз білім беру жүйелеріне енгізулерін және мұндай құбылыстың аса жиілікпен кездесетініне күдікпен қарайтынын байқауға болады.

Басқа мемлекеттерден алынған «үздік тәжірибелердің» отандық білім беру жүйесінде орын табуы және осы тақырыпқа қатысты зерттеушілердің сыни пікірлері нақты алынған мысалдар негізінде талданады. Мақала тақырыпқа байланысты жазылған зерттеулерге назар аудара отырып, Қазақстанның білім жүйесіне келген өзгерістердің оң немесе бұрыс әсер бергендігіне талдау жасайды.

Негізгі сөздер: жаһандану, Назарбаев Зияткерлік мектептері, үздік тәжірибе.

## КРИТИЧЕСКИЙ ЛИТЕРАТУРНЫЙ ОБЗОР О ВЛИЯНИИ ГЛОБАЛИЗАЦИИ НА СИСТЕМУ ОБРАЗОВАНИЯ КАЗАХСТАНА

**Аннотация.** Процесс глобализации непрерывное явление, проникающее во все сферы деятельности. Одним из самых распространенных направлений является образование. Данная статья представляет собой критический обзор литературы о последствиях глобализации и ее влиянии на систему образования Казахстана, обсуждаются события прошлого и настоящего.

Неоднократно отмечалось значимость развития человеческого капитала в Казахстане. Было предпринято множество действий по улучшению качества среднего образования в стране. В статье примером берется сеть Назарбаев интеллектуальных школ, что в свое время и по сей день является флагманом современной школы отвечающего требованиям нового времени. Благодаря данной сети школ были представлены такие важные концепты как критическое мышление, ИКТ компетентность, владение несколькими языками, коммуникативные и коллаборативные (совместная работа) навыки, столь необходимые в современном мире. Данные явления или «заимствования» как отмечают зарубежные авторы, в статье рассматриваются в сравнении с другими странами также имеющих схожие примеры в системе образования.

Тема представляет значительный интерес в связи с увеличением заимствований «лучших практик» у экономически мощных стран. Также в статье обсуждаются примеры лучших практик, критические взгляды исследователей на эту тему, анализируются положительные или отрицательные последствия изменений в системе образования Казахстана.

Ключевые слова: глобализация, Назарбаев Интеллектуальные школы, передовой опыт.

#### **Information about author:**

Zhaukhardariya Yersaiynova, Master in Educational leadership and management, English teacher at Kh. Dosmukhamedov Atyrau University, Atyrau, Kazakhstan, Student Avenue, 1, e-mail: <a href="mailto:zh.ersayynova@asu.edu.kz">zh.ersayynova@asu.edu.kz</a>, <a href="mailto:https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5148-9120">https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5148-9120</a>